

**THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF
YOUNGSTOWN CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT
YOUNGSTOWN, OHIO**

20 West Wood Street

May 23, 2017

The Youngstown Board of Education met in regular session at the I.L. Ward Building on May 23, 2017. The meeting was called to order at 5:31 p.m. by President Brenda Kimble. The meeting opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

Roll call was taken with the following board members in attendance:

Members present: Adair, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Shadd, Williams
Ms. Sanderson arrived at 5:33 pm.

Members absent: None

APPROVE AGENDA

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Williams to approve the agenda as presented.

Roll call vote results were as follows:

Ayes: Adair, Kimble, Murphy, Shadd, Williams

Nays:

Abstain: Hunter, Sanderson

Motion passed.

APPROVE MINUTES

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Williams to approve the minutes from May 9, 2017.

Discussion: Mr. Hunter mentioned that there was an error in the minutes on page three that said (Mr. Hunter said one of the developers called him). Mr. Hunter wanted this changed because the statement would lead readers to believe that one of the developers in this project had called but in fact he was referring to another project. Ms. Kimble asked if the Mr. Hunter wanted to hold the minutes until the corrections were made. Mr. Hunter suggested that the statement be changed and the board would continue on with the vote. Change of minutes will read – a developer from another project instead of one of the developers.

On roll call vote the results were as follows:

Ayes: Adair, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams

Nays:

Motion passed.

CITIZEN'S PARTICIPATION

None

BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS/PRESENTATIONS

Ms. Kimble announced that we were to have a skype session about the 5 year forecast but the firm that prepared it was not available to come. The treasurer will be contacting them to see when they would be available to present. Ms. Adair said she did have some questions about the forecast and she had a list that she would like attached to these minutes. She also said that she did have several questions, Ms. Kimble asked her to make her presentation when the board members give their comments. Mr. Hunter suggested that these questions could also be raised under unfinished business or new business. Mr. Adair wanted to know what did board presentations mean and Ms. Kimble explained it would be presentations such as when the auditors came. Mr. Adair asked what if the members have something to present. Ms. Kimble said this could go under new business.

BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS

Mr. Hunter announced the finance committee meeting would be held on Wednesday, May 23, 2017 in the board caucus room at 6:00 p.m. Mr. Hunter said he has some serious concerns about the lack of communication coming from the CEO, not just communication to the board but also communication to the public. He stated that recently a threat was issued on social media to one of our schools, a very serious issue and board members have to hear about that unfortunately from the press instead of hearing about it from the administrators in this district. This recent incident highlights the need for emergency planning. What procedure is in place when there is a threat of this kind? Who is informed of this issue, who responds to it and how is that information disseminated? We brought this issue up before as a board, before the CEO came on board in this district, but it is one that apparently still needs serious attention. Most importantly, there were parents who wanted to know what the nature of the danger was with this threat and the email sent out to the press as well as the robo-call to parents did not specify what the threat was. Parents had no idea what the risk was to their children. The information was too vague. Another communication problem is between the teachers and the CEO. There is one aspect of this proposed pay raise to the teachers that troubles me, it's the fact that the teachers themselves are kind of blind-sided by it and then they are arguing back and forth with the CEO and his administration. That is not the kind of relationship we would like the district to have with our teachers. There are some very dedicated teachers in the district who work hard despite the circumstances and they deserve the level of buy-in and direct communication that their commitment to this district has earned. He said he would like to see that circumstance improve; he would like to see the district and administration work harder to be on the same page with our highly valued teachers. Another communication issue with the board and the CEO is presentations, we just breezed through the section with no presentations to offer, but what has not been discussed is that part of the reason why that is the case is because when board members try to get people to present to the board, to the public about issues that are happening in this district, the administration, the CEO appears to be actively blocking those attempts. In his time on the board we have not had this problem so what is the issue now? Mr. Hunter said if we do not have updated information and we do not have timely presentations on the issues affecting the district then how are we going to work together to resolve those issues. Mr. Hunter stated that he

takes great issue with the approach the CEO's administration is taking in regards to communication on many fronts.

Mr. Shadd - a few weeks ago he had the opportunity to go to Taft for one of their literacy nights that they have had for the last three to four years. There was roughly about 300 people that attended this event and he said that he really applauds the school for getting people to attend these events that are not traditional things that families usually celebrate at schools. The children and the families participate in events that deal with math and literacy and it was a very successful night. He wanted to thank all of the staff members and say that he truly enjoyed himself while he was there. Mr. Shadd said he had some concerns about what the number was for students who would have to attend summer school. Ms. Kimble said the last she had heard it was 2,000 students but there had been no final confirmation on the number. Mr. Shadd said at the last CEO meeting they had transformation officers come in and talk about the strides of the afterschool program and some training that was happening for the staff but if the successes of after school are so large how is that success benefiting our children day to day? They have not shown him what that correlation is yet and he is very concerned about that since they would like to change the summer school process to include a half day of fun activities. Will this afterschool help children get to the level they need to be at and how does it work with the academics.

Ms. Sanderson - had been visiting schools, talking to parents, administrators and teachers and some of the feedback she was getting is that parents do not feel like they are being heard, as well as the students. They feel like promises that have been made are not being kept. In addition, some of our teachers and administrators are feeling a little intimidated, feeling pressured, like they cannot come to board members and speak freely. There is fear of some type of punishment if they do speak and what that makes me weary of that if there is an incident that goes on in school and if that person reports any of the information what might happen if they report it to the proper authorities or report it to the board. We have to have some type of open communication. Ms. Sanderson said she felt that the CEO had not been doing a very good job of that. She stated that recently a teacher told her they had been doing a lot of professional development and with that being said there is not a lot of coverage in the classrooms. That is a problem and also she said she did not see why they wait to the end of the school year to bombard the teachers with professional development; she said they needed it at the beginning of the school year so that they could use it in the classroom since she is hearing our projected state report card is not much better. Ms. Sanderson said just by the reports coming through the media she is really concerned that the board is not being told first because when the district gets sued that is us, we are getting sued. Even though we do not have authority we still care about our children and the district. Information like that should not go to the media first that needs to come to the board. Ms. Sanderson said she spoke to Mr. Olverson about her concerns regarding communication with the CEO and she said she is waiting to hear back from the CEO since last week about building some type of form for communication on how is he going to contact the board about private information when it is concerning our personnel and our students?

Mr. Murphy - his problem is also communication. He said if it wasn't for the Vindicator he would not know what was going on in this district and as a board member that is very sad. Mr. Murphy said he brought this up when the CEO first started that the board did not know information, he said the board got a little back then but now they get none at all. Mr. Murphy also stated that a principals meeting - meet the principal at 3:30, how do parents get there? Parents work until four or five o'clock; he said he works until four or five o'clock and I had no

chance to attend. Mr. Murphy said to him it sounds like they did not want anyone at that meeting. No parents that work could have possibly attended. The whole communication issue is ridiculous in this school district.

Mr. Williams had no comments.

Ms. Adair said in terms of communication the CEO was holding a meeting at the same time that the board was having their meeting, why would you do that? Why are staff members being told not to attend our meetings? People that work in this district that back in the day we hired why are they not here talking to us and sharing information about what is going on in the district with the board and committee? Ms. Adair asked for her notes to be included with the minutes. They are attached to the minutes; they are the notes that are following paper to be included in the minutes. They are attached behind page 6.

Ms. Adair said she had several questions about the five year forecast regarding some of their assumptions. She is really concerned about purchased services and how that is going to affect the budget since it is using a big chunk of the money we bring in. She would ask about Medicaid reimbursement at another time. A real shocker was the statement in the forecast about the county auditor making a slight adjustment to mileage for the loss of state revenue in 2018. Ms. Adair wanted to know why board members are not receiving robo calls, why are board members not receiving emails about teacher assaults, why are we not being informed? Ms. Adair said the use of profane language by staff and students is unacceptable and this goes for students with disabilities too. Ms. Adair said we need to pass a resolution to stop the allowable use of profanity in our buildings by any and all who enter. She went on to say that she had heard Choffin was being turned over to the Mahoning County ESC. Ms. Adair said absenteeism cost the district dollars, use of substitutes contributes to low or poor academic performance of the students and we cannot find enough of qualified people to fill in for people who chose not to come to work, what are we doing about the poor attendance rate of the staff? Our attendance rate is somewhere around 90 to 91%, this was also mentioned in the five year forecast. Ms. Adair then asked what year we are operating in under HB 70 year one or two; she would like to know from some legal person because CEO Mohip has said he believes we are in year two which gives him some authority to do some things with the union contracts. Ms. Adair reminded the board that in year three if the CEO and his staff have not turned the district around academically, then we as board members can be removed and replaced by a board appointed by the mayor of Youngstown. So do we have one more year or two? Ms. Adair said she is hearing so many complaints about how the students are dressing coming to school. Ms. Adair said we have an obligation to get students ready for the world and this is not working. Ms. Adair then talked about the pay raise. She said she read that some teachers are not teaching up to state standards and now you want to give them a raise before they have a proven track record. What will that do to the bottom line? Ms. Adair said pay raises should be based on outcomes and performances.

Ms. Kimble - wanted to comment about the after school program where they stated how much the students had grown in math and reading. She said if the growth is true growth then teachers should receive the accolades because they teach the children every day. She reminded the board that there was an invitation to the Adult Education graduation. Ms. Kimble said she felt that attempts to keep information from the board were juvenile. Ms. Kimble felt that in the elementary school bullying was out of hand and she thinks it is because some programs have

been removed. Ms. Adair asked the administration of the CEO to treat the board like they would like to be treated.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Hunter said there were a number of issues being brought up about communication and asked Mr. Olverson to address those issues. Mr. Olverson said that information on how the CEO would address the board would come from Mr. Mohip. Mr. Hunter then replied that the CEO was not at the meeting and he schedules meetings at the same time the board has meetings and you are telling us that he will respond at some point. Mr. Olverson then said Mr. Mohip will respond in kind to the board members at some point.

Mr. Hunter then asked Mr. Olverson why was he there? Mr. Olverson said he takes the information back to the CEO and Mr. Mohip will respond back to the board. Mr. Hunter then asked Ms. Dick is she would like to answer the question since she was the spoke person for the district. Ms. Dick said Mr. Mohip will respond to the board. Ms. Sanderson then asked Mr. Olverson if in Mr. Mohip's absence wouldn't he stand in his place? Mr. Mohip then entered and said no, that was a question they would have to ask the distress commission. Ms. Sanderson responded no, it really was not. Mr. Hunter then asked if he could reassert his earlier questions about his concerns about the lack of communication regarding the student threat, the teacher issue and presentations to the board and asked Mr. Mohip to address the questions. Mr. Mohip said he would address any and all concerns at the CEO update meeting. Mr. Mohip said put the questions in writing. Mr. Mohip restated that he would answer any questions at the CEO update and wanted to publicly thank the four board members who regularly attend those meetings. Mr. Hunter said he was sorry that the CEO was so arrogant that he felt like he did not have to answer the questions. The CEO responded by addressing Ms. Kimble and saying I have answered his question but he just did not like my response.

Ms. Kimble said she spoke with Mr. Olverson about answering questions and he said he was there to take notes and questions back to the CEO for him to answer. She said he had taken some questions for Ms. Adair and since the CEO has the power and he said he would answer the questions at his update meeting there is not a whole lot anyone else can do except attend those meetings. Ms. Adair stated that Mr. Olverson had said he would forward her questions to Mr. Mohip for a response. Ms. Adair then said in a sense of cooperation it would seem that since the CEO was here he could answer the questions. It is just basic questions and Ms. Adair said she is not attending the update meetings. The board agreed to two meetings a month, she was elected and they are not and she was not going to be held hostage so that she could come and bow down at the feet of the CEO's staff. Ms. Adair said if Mr. Mohip did not want to answer the questions that she gave to Mr. Olverson right now then she did not see why Mr. Mohip was at the meeting. Was it to spy or gloat, she does not know; it is unfortunate that HB70 is here because the district has been under the control of the state since 2010 yet the board got zapped for the states failure. She said she is with the president that we have to do whatever we need to do to get these people off our back and out of our pockets.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was motioned by Ms. Adair to adjourn the regular business meeting of the board to go into executive session to discuss complaints against an employee and investigate charges against employees and students and also to discuss the sale of property at competitive bidding. I am hearing two pieces of property 20 W. Wood Street and Choffin. It was seconded by Ms. Sanderson.

Roll call vote results were as follows:

Ayes: Adair, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams

Nays:

Motion passed

Ms. Kimble told the audience there would be no formal action taken when the regular meeting resumed but Mr. Shadd clarified that the motion made by Ms. Adair was to close out the regular session so that they would not have to return when the executive session was over.

The meeting adjourned at 6:23 pm and the board entered into executive session at 6:24 pm.

President

Treasurer

Board Meeting
May 23, 2017

Notes

1. Board presentations:
 - a. Five year forecast – comments/ concerns
 - (1) District must renew fixed sum emergency levy
 - (2) Enrollment presents challenges – what is being done?
 - (3) Local economic conditions are not indicating greater growth in local property tax revenue contradict #5 above – in the summary.
 - (4) 2015 – 2016 revenue was overstated because the district posted a portion of its restricted state funding in this category. What is restricted state funding? Was this legal?
 - (5) The county auditor will make “slight adjustments” to millage to compensate for the loss of state revenue starting in FY 2018. What does this mean?
 - (6) Medicaid reimbursement of \$729,612. What is this? Explain!
 - (7) Purchased services – 1st largest expense – contracted services, new programs with local partnerships.
 - b. Why are Board members not receiving robo calls?
 - c. Why are board members not being informed about unfortunate incidents (fights, teacher assaults) happening in our buildings. We used to receive emails from the office of supt.
 - d. Use of profane language by staff and students – not acceptable! Elementary aged students are using language toward teachers and other students that would singe the hairs in my ears! This has got to stop! We must demand a higher level of professionalism from staff and must not permit our students to use this kind of language, especially when too many of them can't even speak understandable standard English! My concerns involve special ed students as well. I do not want to hear that a child's disability involves the allowable use of profanity. We must prepare our students for life after high school! The proper civil use of appropriate language is vital to their success. So let's raise our voices against this abomination and pass a resolution to stop the allowable use of profanity in our building by any and all who enter, especially Staff and students!!!!

- e. What is going on with Choffin? What am I hearing about it being turned over to Mahoning co. Education service center? – Should this issue be raise first in Executive session?
- f. Staff attendance – what is being done about the poor attendance rate of the staff? Absenteeism costs the district dollars (use of substitutes) and contributes to low or poor academic performance of the students!
- g. What year are we operating in according to HB70, Year one or year two?
- h. Dress code? Where do I begin?

Executive Session:

Madam president I move to adjourn the regular business meeting of the board so that we my go into executive session to discuss complaint against an employee and investigate charges against employees, and students. Also to discuss the sale of property at competitive bidding – 20 W. Wood stree and Choffin.

J. Adair